Reviewer's report

Title: Outcome after Intensity Modulated Radiotherapy for Anaplastic Thyroid Carcinoma

Version: 3 Date: 7 November 2013

Reviewer: José M Gómez-Sáez

Reviewer's report:

The article: “Outcome after Intensity Modulated Radiotherapy for Anaplastic Thyroid Carcinoma” by He Xiayun Sr, Li Duanshu Sr, Hu Chaosu Sr, Wang Zhuoying Sr, Ying Hongmei Sr and Wu Yi Sr to be published in BMC Cancer is an important article about this matter because the previous series in anaplastic carcinoma are limited as consequence that is a rare malignancy. Is also important because the studies with intensity modulated radiotherapy are scarce and is a modality of treatment encouraging when is combined with surgery and chemotherapy.

The question is well defined
The data are well controlled

The discussion and conclusion are supported by the data
The methods are partially well described because the omitted the methods about surgery an chemotherapy

The strengths of the article is the number the cases introduced, the treatment and the long follow up of the patients.

The tables are well organized.
The article is ethical.

The main flaws of the article are:
1. The abstract do not contain and do not express the combined treatment with surgery and especially with chemotherapy and their influence in the beneficial outcome.

2. The authors should include in methods the possibility that the patients would be concurrent or adjuvant treated with surgery and chemotherapy and the guidelines for this treatment.

3. They should explain the higher proportion of men in this series.

4. The authors should add after every authors in the text, et al as in line 53, 205, etc.