Reviewer’s report

Title: Study of chemoprevention of asiaticoside on rats and tumor cells

Version: 4
Date: 5 December 2013
Reviewer: Wei Liu

Reviewer’s report:

Overall, this paper described interesting finding of Asiaticoside on tumor inhibition.

Several points needs to be clarified:

1. The title could be more appropriate as cytotoxicity of Asiaticoside, rather than “chemoprevention of Asiaticoside”. If you means to talk about cancer prevention or chemotherapy modulator, that would be whole different interesting issues.

2. In Figure 2, please add Asiaticoside only group as control, even though they might not have cytotoxicity effect.

3. In figure 3 Y axis label, it should be “% of fragmented DNA”

4. In Figure 4, please provide one western blot gel running the same lysate you prepared for Elisa and probe for caspase 3 or caspase 7.

5. In figure 7, please present tumor volume of all 5 groups, not just group 2 and group 3.

6. In general, please also add a figure presenting the pictures of those breast cancer tissue being used for in vivo study.

As we all know, in in vivo context, tumor suffer more likely hypoxia rather than hyperxia. In your study, you use H2O2 to combine with Asiaticoside to treat breast cancer. Do you know the HiF1alpha status of those cell lines and spontaneous breast cancer rat model? Are they HiF1 wildtype or mutant?

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests