Reviewer's report

Title: Bcl-2 associated athanogene 5 (Bag5) is overexpressed in prostate cancer and inhibits ER-stress induced apoptosis

Version: 1 Date: 19 August 2012

Reviewer: Paul Townsend

Reviewer's report:

An interesting study that has signs of novelty but this reviewer has some issues with the results and lack of detail.

General - The authors refer to BPH-1 cells but do not say where they originate from; from searching ATCC I can not see them but have found in other papers. This needs clarifying.

Grammar, punctuation and polishing definitely required. Surprisingly very poor. This paper needs to be read by a native English speaker and edited heavily. I am concerned that not all authors have seen this final version - esp Professor Cato.

Specifics - ALL need correcting.

Figure 1A - Not labelled as A
- there is not a full description of the normalisation of qPCR data
- how was Ct converted to relative gene expression?

Figure 1B - Also not labelled

Figure 1C - Does not seem to relate to the IHC they describe, it's a western! Explain. The legend does not shed any light on this either.

Figure 1D - Blot is unclear - far too exposed and needs repeating.

Figure 2B - How long were these treated for?
- Again, no detail on qPCR normalisation and relative gene expression calculation
- Axes slightly different

Figure 2C - Bag 5 in TN treated cells - blot rather poor...doublet, unclear.
- PC3 data in supplementary data - why not include here in the main paper?

Figure 2D - Images not great quality either. Lack of DAPI which would be nice to contrast against their diffuse cyto staining.

Figure 2F - GRP78 also seems to increase but this is not mentioned.

Figure 5F - not mentioned in text.

Overall, decent scientific findings but sloppy presentation.
Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

No issues to declare.