Reviewer's report

Title: Overall survival is correlated with histology of bladder cancer in patients treated with cystectomy and adjuvant cisplatin-based chemotherapy

Version: 1 Date: 29 October 2012

Reviewer: Theodorus Van der Kwast

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions:
1) There seems to be an overrepresentation of plasmacytoid variant of UC (n=18, about 10%) , and it is not clear where these patients originate from: part (166) is from the AUO-AB05/95 trial, but 39 seem to come from elsewhere). I would like to see the distribution of variants in the two populations. Could there be a bias explaining why a) PUC pts are younger and b) have a different prognosis? Explain why this overrepresentation of PUC in this series!

Further, please mention in the discussion that overall survival is measured as outcome parameter which is of course a limitation.

Minor essential revisions:
1) Supplementary table 1 is not complete, please fill out %. Now, it almost unreadable.
2) discussion is very lengthy and could be condensed substantially.
3) the title is somewhat inadequate: I would suggest that it includes plasmacytoid variant.

Specifics:
3) On page 7 please insert "PUC" before "patients" in the sentence ...using gemcitabine and cisplatin may occur at least in a subgroup of patients.. ..Otherwise it is not clear for the reader.

4) In the supplemental table 1 grades include grade 2 and 3, apparently from the WHO 1973 system. Given the retrospective review, I would expect that they would have been graded using WHO 2004. lease explain in M&M which grading system was used.

Page 8 lower part: "Our results clearly show that MPC morphology is..... " I do not understand this statement in this context as the authors show that MPC has no impact on overall survival.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.