Reviewer's report

Title: Comparative performances of prognostic indexes for breast cancer patients presenting with brain metastases

Version: 1 Date: 19 December 2012

Reviewer: Romuald LE SCODAN

Reviewer's report:

Comparative performances of prognostic indexes for breast cancer patients presenting with brain metastases.

This is a nice article that attempts to compare the performances of PI in breast cancer patients with BM.

I have only some minor concerns regarding this article.

The nature of the 250 consecutive patients should be clarified. How many total patients with breast cancer were examined? Did all patients received WBRT? Did any patients receive either surgery or radiosurgery?

The patient selection needs further explaining as about 2/3 of the patients are ROTG Class I; This suggests that this population was made of “low risk” patients, possibly not perfectly representing the “routine clinical practice population” as mentioned in the discussion.

Page 7. Patients characteristics: median age range: 23 (manuscript) or 25 (table2) years?

Table 3. Performance status should be reported according the KPS, as used in the RTOG RPA classification.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests'