Reviewer’s report

Title: Napsin A as a marker of clear cell ovarian carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 2 September 2013

Reviewer: Toshihiko Torigoe

Reviewer’s report:

The authors examined the positivity of Napsin A, p21, p27 and p53 in ovarian cancer tissues by immunohistochemistry. The results showed that positivity of Napsin A was significantly associated with clear cell carcinoma. It was also associated with concomitant positivity for p21 and negativity of p53. They concluded that Napsin A should become a marker of clear cell ovarian carcinoma.

The rationale of the study is clear and the experiments were conducted well. The study should contribute to the pathological diagnosis of ovarian cancer.

Minor essential comment:
1. English grammar and spellings should be checked precisely.

Discretionary comments:
1. The authors proposed that Napsin-A positivity of clear cell carcinoma might predict about platinum sensitivity in the discussion (page 16). Is there any evidence supporting the proposal? For example, is there any report showing that Napsin A-positive lung cancers or renal cell cancers are resistant to platinum chemotherapy?
2. It is informative if the authors discuss the positivity of Napsin A and p21/p53 status of other cancers such as renal cell cancers and lung cancers.
3. Representative IHC pictures of Napsin A +, ++, ++++, and negative cases should be presented in Figure 1.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.