Reviewer's report

Title: Napsin A as a marker of clear cell ovarian carcinoma

Version: 1  Date: 24 August 2013

Reviewer: Zannoni Gian Franco

Reviewer's report:

The authors evaluate the role of Napsin-A as marker of ovarian clear cell carcinoma. As correctly pointed out in the manuscript, the differential diagnosis between high grade serous and clear cell ovarian cancer can be very difficult. Therefore, it is certainly useful to identify novel biomarkers able to help pathologists in achieving a final correct diagnosis. For these reasons, the novelty and scientific relevance of the manuscript seem to be acceptable.

On the other hand, some major criticisms have to be raised, in particular:
-Although the authors investigated a quite large series of advanced ovarian cancer, only 16 patients were affected by clear cell carcinoma, thus potentially biasing the reliability of provided results. Please, consider extension of study population; otherwise, emphasize this study limitation in the manuscript.
- The authors provide a multivariate analysis using Napsin-A as end-point (Table 4 A-B). However, it is more appropriate to evaluate the role of Napsin A, and other clinico-pathological factors as predictor of clear cell histology. For these reasons, I recommend to reformulate data analysis choosing clear cell histology as primary end-point.
- It seems that the "p21+p53- phenotype" could be associated with Napsin A expression, and clear cell histology. Therefore, it remains unclear what Napsin A really add to the "p21+p53- phenotype" along the process of differential diagnosis. Please consider this specific point in the discussion section.
- Since the main goal of the manuscript is to evaluate the predictive role of a novel biomarker, it could be useful to provide a more advanced statistical analysis, including ROC curves, focused on evaluating the predictive role of Napsin A for clear cell histology.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests