Reviewer's report

Title: Potential cancer-related role of circadian gene TIMELESS suggested by expression profiling and in vitro analyses

Version: 1 Date: 27 June 2013

Reviewer: William Hrushesky

Reviewer's report:

First, I am familiar with the lab. It is essentially a molecular epidemiology, rather than a molecular biology, lab. It is a good molecular epidemiology laboratory and an adequate cancer molecular biology laboratory. This distinction is very important when deciding what to do with this paper. This paper must thereby, be considered as a cancer epidemiology paper...not as a strictly hypothesis driven mechanistic molecular biology of cancer paper.

Epidemiology papers make associations and correlations they do not strictly test molecular mechanisms. Good molecular Epidemiology papers add several levels of molecular correlation and association... THEY DO NOT AND CANNOT, by their nature, prove that a certain gene product causes a certain cancer or class of cancers.

This paper piles up a rather huge and convincing hill of molecular evidence that TIMELESS may be relevant to cancer cause, growth and spread... Across a wide rage of human and experimental cancers.

I will not with your understanding, parrot all or even some of these more and less convincing observations, analyses and experiments. None are perfect BUT the sum total of evidence convinces me and will convince your readers that TIMELESS is of interest in cancer biology and control. This IS important, if not strictly novel.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no conflicts of interest in reviewing this paper