Reviewer's report

Title: Activity ex vivo of cytotoxic drugs in patient samples of peritoneal carcinomatosis with special focus on colorectal cancer: a preclinical study

Version: 2 Date: 13 February 2013

Reviewer: Melissa Teo

Reviewer's report:

• Major Compulsory Revisions

The author must respond to these before a decision on publication can be reached. For example, additional necessary experiments or controls, statistical mistakes, errors in interpretation.

- The idea behind the authors’ paper is interesting and of particular importance to those working in this field of work. However, the drug sensitivity of the ex-vivo patient samples of various PC tumours were investigated and some logical conclusions were made as a result of their findings with regards to the efficacy and potential effectiveness of the various drugs tested, these results were not correlated with the clinical outcomes of the patients. The drugs used in the IPC for the individual patients, with respect to the drug sensitivity for these patients were not depicted.

- Similarly, the results of the ex-vivo drug sensitivity of the tumour samples were not correlated to whether the patients even received IPC, as tumour samples were taken from patients who underwent surgery, including those who did not receive IPC.

- PC tissue samples from multiple tumour types were obtained and apart from the general observations of the sensitivity of these histological types to the drugs ex-vivo, no additional information was provided regarding the clinical outcomes of the patients with the various tumour types and their drug sensitivity results.

- It is interesting to note that oxaliplatin showed the most favourable ratio but this information was not shown to be of any relevance in this study. Whilst understanding that this is a pre-clinical study, it would have been of greater importance if this information showed clinical relevance, even if it were merely an observation made from those in their patient population who received oxaliplatin.

- The title suggests an aim to look at the activity of cytotoxics in ex-vivo samples and achieves that in part but its special focus on colorectal cancer does not yield anything significant findings.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests