Reviewer's report

Title: Prognosis of Rectal Cancer Patients improves analog to Downstaging by intensified neoadjuvant Radiochemotherapy - a matched pair analysis

Version: 1 Date: 17 April 2013

Reviewer: Guoxiang Cai

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

It is unfair to draw a conclusion that neoadjuvant RCT can improve the prognosis of rectal cancer pts based on the post neoadjuvant RCT surgical pathological TNM stage. I would recommend to use the cTNM stage of pre-neoadjuvant therapy (stage 2/3) and the matching stage 2/3 without neoadjuvant therapy (pTNM stage).

Minor Essential Revisions

Some important information was missed in this study:
First, there is no information about the postoperative chemo of the pts in the study group. And we do not know how many pts with pathological stage 2/3 underwent adjuvant radiochemotherapy in the control group.
Second, the staging method was not mentioned.
Third, the author did not mention the criteria of efficacy evaluation of neoadjuvant therapy.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.