Reviewer's report

**Title:** Clinical features and outcome of cryptogenic hepatocellular carcinoma compared to those of viral and alcoholic hepatocellular carcinoma

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 7 April 2013

**Reviewer:** Kazushi Sugimoto

**Reviewer's report:**

In this manuscript entitled 'Clinical features and outcome of cryptogenic hepatocellular carcinoma compared to those of viral and alcoholic hepatocellular carcinoma ', authors analyzed clinical features of 350 cases of HCC. Their main findings were about 6% of HCC cases in Korea was cryptogenic (thought to be burnt-out NASH) and these HCCs were less aggressive tumor characteristics with lower rate of portal vein invasion.

There are several flaws that prevent acceptance to BMC Cancer.

**Major Compulsory Revisions**

#1 Analyses were made on small number of samples obtained from only one hospital. Therefore, I do not think their data reflect the characteristics of HCC in Korea precisely.

#2 The clinical features of cryptogenic or NAFLD-related HCC have been reported by several groups with more sample numbers. I wonder if this study adds new finding to the previous reports.

#3 The clinical histories of cryptogenic HCC patients were unclear. For example, it was not described if BMI and ALT were fluctuated in these patients in the past which were frequently observed in NASH/NAFLD patients.

#4 The authors stated 15 out of 20 cryptogenic HCC had liver cirrhosis. The authors should clarify if the remaining 5 patients had NAFLD/NASH in the result section.

**Level of interest:** An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.