Reviewer's report

Title: Optimal schedule of Bacillus Calmette-Guerin for non-muscle-invasive bladder cancer: A meta-analysis of comparative studies

Version: 1 Date: 15 January 2013

Reviewer: Ashish Kamat

Reviewer's report:

This article is a meta-analysis of 29 studies regarding optimal BCG treatment for NMIBC, including maintenance v. induction, low dose v. standard dose, and combination therapy. The authors concluded that maintenance BCG, standard dose BCG, and BCG + epirubicin showed significantly better RFS compared to induction BCG, low-dose BCG, and BCG alone, respectively. Only maintenance BCG demonstrated significantly better RFS as well as PFS. However, maintenance BCG was associated with more adverse events.

Abstract:
1. “However, additional interferon #2b might be useful for patients with BCG refractory cases.” No data presented in the results section supports this sentence.

Methods and statistics were appropriate.
The data was presented in an unbiased manner.

Discussion:
1. Why was reference 45 not used in the meta-analysis regarding BCG and IFN? Was it excluded and why? Are there other studies to support the use of INF in BCG refractory patients?
2. Add further discussion of publication bias in high-risk NMIBC subgroup analysis. How does this impact the interpretation of the results?

Figure numbers (1-11) do not match legend (1A/B-5A/B, 6).
The manuscript would benefit from scientific review to correct grammatical errors.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
None