Reviewer's report

Title: Role of Notch1 Expression in the Migration of Intrahepatic Cholangiocarcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 10 December 2012

Reviewer: Hideo Baba

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

Authors indicated that Notch1 induces migratory effect on ICC by causing epithelial- mesenchymal transition, activating Rac1. However there are many problems in this manuscript. I have the following comments.

Comments

1. Notch 1 expression in human samples was indicated only by RT-PCR in figure 1. Author should demonstrated western blotting of Notch1.

2. Author showed Notch1 and ICN expression level in cancer and noncancerous tissue in the same patient. However, major of noncancerous tissue should be hepatocytes, and normal biliary epithelial cells are not much.

3. Cell proliferation assay should be performed in Notch1 overexpression and knockdown experiments.

4. Generally, research manuscript should be made carefully. This manuscript has many crucial deficiencies. Figure 1 should be explained in the results section in detail. Figure 1 is inconsistent with the Legend of Figure 1. Figure 1.2 is not explained in the manuscript and figure legends at all. Figure 2A and 3A should be explained in detail (What do the lanes1-3 mean?). Figure 3 is inconsistent with the Legend of Figure 3.

5. In the discussion section, lines 29-30 in page9 need the references.

6. In the discussion section, lines 5-20 in page10 are only repeats of the results section.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.