Reviewer's report

Title: Advance lung cancer inflammation index (ALI) at diagnosis is a prognostic marker in patients with metastatic non-small cell lung cancer (NSCLC): A retrospective review

Version: 1 Date: 17 December 2012

Reviewer: Donald C McMillan

Reviewer's report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions

This is an interesting paper in a difficult to treat group of patients. However, the authors need to be much more transparent in how the index was derived. In particular, it is clear that a number of the factors that go into the index are associated with each other and therefore the individual factors should have independent prognostic value (e.g. BMI, neutrophil and lymphocyte counts). Also, how was the threshold value for the ALI determined. The ROC analysis should be shown.

The discussion largely avoids discussing their results and has a number of statements that are not substantiated or justified by their results or that of the literature.

For example “ALI is based on everyday clinical parameters i.e. BMI, serum albumin and NLR for which no extra test like CRP is need which is otherwise not routinely performed in NSCLC patients. Moreover as opposed to the Glasgow prognostic score it is exclusively derived from patients with stage IV or metastatic lung cancer.”

Only one sentence is given to the need for validation.

As a result much of the discussion appears speculative.

- Minor Essential Revisions

The English and grammar is of a poor standard. The authors should attempt to improve this.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests