Reviewer's report

Title: HP1-gamma expression is elevated in prostate cancer and is superior to
Gleason score as a predictor of biochemical recurrence after radical
prostatectomy

Version: 1 Date: 22 October 2012

Reviewer: Susan K Logan

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript examines expression of the heterochromatin protein HP1
gamma and Ki67 in prostate cancer.

Minor essential revisions:

On page 8 the authors indicate that HP1 gamma is over-expressed in 26% of
benign cores. Please explain how this marker has predictive value in light of this
fact.

Page 9, top. The text sounds as if the correlation were strongest for HP1 gamma
and Ki67 cytoplasmic expression. Since Ki67 is nuclear this is hard to interpret.
However, the figure indicates that it is always nuclear Ki67 being correlated with
total, nuclear or cytoplasmic HP1 gamma expression. Please clarify in the text.

Page 12. Please clarify the sentence “One explanation for the robustness of
HP1 is that its prognostic value is not confounded by other factors ...”.

Figure 1 is difficult to interpret. For example, figure 2 shows only a 1.5-2 fold
difference in HP1 gamma staining between benign and cancer specimens, but
Figure 1 shows no HP1 gamma staining. Is the staining really all or none? It is
not clear if the benign and cancer samples shown here are at the same
magnification. For clarity, it would be helpful to have the H & E staining if it is
possible.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the
statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.