Reviewer's report

Title: Aluminum concentrations in central and peripheral areas of malignant breast lesions do not differ from those in normal breast tissues

Version: 3 Date: 2 November 2012

Reviewer: Philippa Darbre

Reviewer's report:

The revised version of the manuscript has addressed some of the comments made in my original review. However, some have not been addressed.

The main outstanding comment which has not been addressed is as to why the data have been analysed solely on the basis of three linear groupings. In the revised manuscript, the methods section under statistical analysis now states that "Log-transformed (log) values were used, since the raw data showed marked skewness". If this is so, why then are the data still grouped into three linear groupings for analysis? The data need analysing on the basis of a log distribution and not a linear distribution and would be better analysed using original raw data, not an artificial set of three linear groupings.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I am an author on several of the references which they cite.