Reviewer's report

Title: HuR Cytoplasmic Expression is Associated with Increased Cyclin A Expression and Poor Outcome in Upper Urinary Tract Urothelial Carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 5 October 2012

Reviewer: Yasuyoshi Miyata

Reviewer's report:

The author investigated cytoplasmic expression of HuR in upper urinary tract urothelial carcinoma (UTUC). In addition, they also analyzed relationships between its expression and clinicopathological features, prognosis, and cyclin A expression. This study showed that cytoplasmic HuR expression was closely associated with malignant potential, survivals, and cyclin A overexpression in 340 patients with UTUC. Finally, they concluded that HuR cytoplasmic expression plays important roles for carcinogenesis and it is potential prognostic marker of these patients.

I appreciate that this study has interesting results and important information regarding pathological and molecular characteristics of UTUC. In addition, study population is enough to discuss on pathological significance of cytoplasmic HuR expression. However, I have some questions and you should answer them.

(Major Compulsory Revisions)

1) I am afraid that authors are too many for study design. Please tell me individual roles in this study.

2) Survival analyses are important examinations in this study. So, adjuvant therapy is seemed to be essential factor for analyses and discussion. Please add more detailed information on adjuvant therapy including number of patients in each chemotherapeutic regimen. In addition, please show prognostic roles of adjuvant therapy in uni- and/or multi-variate analyses.

3) You concluded that HuR cytoplasmic expression was associated with tumorigenesis or carcinogenesis. However, its expression in normal urothelial cells is not showed in this study. Please modify this sentence and tell me your opinion.

(Minor Essential Revisions)

1) In ABSTRACT, Methods section is too simple. Please modify it.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.