Reviewer's report

Title: HuR Cytoplasmic Expression is Associated with Increased Cyclin A Expression and Poor Outcome in Upper Urinary Tract Urothelial Carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 1 October 2012

Reviewer: Ghulam Nabi

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript entitled “HuR cytoplasmic Expression is Associated with Increased Cyclin A Expression and Poor Outcome in Upper Urinary Tract Urothelial Carcinoma” describes prognostic significance of a new biomarker. I have following comments:

1. Novelty of the concept: Although, HuR cytoplasmic expression has not been reported in the upper tract transitional cell carcinoma, the main question of clinical relevance as whether HuR expression adds anything to already established histopathological information such as grade and stage remains unanswered from this study (multivariate analysis does not show any significance). The paper just shows that high HuR expression has a poor prognosis just like in other cancers.

2. Methodology of the study design: Study is retrospective in nature and certainly there are a number of biases such clinical end points of urinary bladder and systemic recurrences are missing.

3. Quality of presentation: The manuscript could be improved by a revision in grammar, syntax and spellings.

4. Figures and Table: OK

5. Ethical Issues: Addressed appropriately

Overall, study does not add anything to enhance translational research in upper tract transitional cell carcinoma, however it does point out to the correlation between expression of HuR cytoplasmic and Cyclin A expression to poor pathological characteristics of the disease.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.