Reviewer’s report

Title: Neck Control after Definitive Radiochemotherapy without Planned Neck Dissection in Node-Positive Head and Neck Cancers

Version: 2 Date: 23 December 2011

Reviewer: Steffi Ulrike Pigorsch

Reviewer’s report:

I read the re-writed manuscript by Dr Yang et al.
1. The authors tried to answer all my and Dr Kuhnts open questions and implemented some new and interesting details. Nevertheless it remains unclear for me to summarize NPC and HNSCC, but the statistical calculation the authors made, seems to give this opportunity.
2. The PET data interpretation seems to be subjective (visual interpretation). But the authors gave some SUV calculated by using tumor-background ratio and tumor- blood pool ratio. The subdivision of the PET results concerning regional control in residual disease (PET), reactive / normal changes (PET) and no PET is hard to understand. In summary there was no difference between these three groups.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.