Reviewer's report

Title: MicroRNA-99a Induces G1-Phase Cell Cycle Arrest and Suppresses Tumorigenicity in Renal Cell Carcinoma

Version: 2 Date: 21 September 2012

Reviewer: Annika Fendler

Reviewer's report:

The authors of the manuscript describe a tumorsuppressive role of miR-99a in renal cell carcinoma. In general the study is well-defined. The novelty of the result is nevertheless limited as miR-99a has been shown to be downregulated in several human cancers and to target the mTOR pathway before (see: Oneyama et al. Oncogene (2011) 30:3489–350. and Li et al. J Biol Chem. (2011) 286:36677-85.). Thus, the study only confirms this interaction in renal cell cancer.

Some revision should be made to make the manuscript suitable for publication.

Major compulsory revisions:
The number of patients is rather small. To provide stronger evidence that miR-99a is downregulated in renal cell cancer, the data should at least be validated by bootstrapping or crossvalidation. Preferably, the authors should confirm their findings in a second sample set and provide appropriate statistics.

Discretionary revisions:
The results from the miR-99a expression analysis are repeated in detail in the discussion. The paragraph can be shortened by leaving out the repetition of results.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.