**Reviewer's report**

**Title:** Rare case of primary clear cell sarcoma of the pubic bone with appearance of small round cell tumor: an unusual morphologic variant

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 4 June 2012

**Reviewer:** Alessandro Franchi

**Reviewer's report:**

The Authors report on a case of a putative primitive clear cell sarcoma of bone involving the pubic bone.

**Major compulsory revisions**

- I have some concerns on the diagnosis of clear cell sarcoma in this bone tumor. Indeed, this is based only on the immunohistochemical findings indicating melanocytic differentiation. The translocation of clear cell sarcoma investigated by FISH for the EWS gene is negative, as it has been in few other cases of primary clear cell sarcoma of bone. What is to me non convincing is the histological aspect of the tumor which is not consistent with that of clear cell sarcoma including the cases of primary bone tumors reported so far. The round cell morphology with diffuse architecture and the dense chromatin with inconspicuous nucleolus are not features of clear cell sarcoma. Conversely, clear cell sarcoma shows a nested architecture, cells are oval with clear cytoplasm and the nucleus contains a prominent nucleolus. From the illustration provided, which is of poor quality, this is therefore more likely to be a metastatic melanoma. The rapidly fatal clinical course is also inconsistent with primary clear cell sarcoma of bone, since the cases reported so far had a more prolonged survival, and again this points more towards metastatic disease. I suggest to analyze the status of BRAF gene, which is often mutated in melanoma, but not in clear cell sarcoma. Better quality histological images should be submitted.

- The Reference list is incomplete. There are other more recent reports on primary clear cell sarcoma of bone (Skeletal Radiol 2011; 40:633–639; World J Surg Oncol. 2011; 9: 163.) that should be included; they also present a review of the literature.

**Minor Essential Revisions**

- The paper needs extensive language revision.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

No competing interests to declare