Reviewer's report

Title: A Meta-analysis of the Randomized Controlled Trials on Hyperthermic Intraperitoneal Chemotherapy for Gastric Cancer

Version: 2 Date: 15 August 2012

Reviewer: Wu Ai-Wen

Reviewer's report:

The meta-analysis addressing the issue of hyperthermic intraperitoneal chemotherapy for gastric cancer is a well-done study. However, there are several points:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The selection criteria is RCT studies focusing on advanced gastric cancer patients consisted of macroscopic serosal invasion and without distant metastasis or peritoneal carcinomatosis. Whether the surgery is R0 or R1 resection needs to be addressed in the dataset. For patients with R0 resection but high probability of peritoneal recurrence, HIPC may play an important role. There is the point for this meta-analysis, but no data is available.

Minor Essential Revisions

2. The limitation of meta-analysis is its dependence on the quality of RCT studies. However, even with the Jadad scoring system, the quality of RCT studies can not be fully accessed. Therefore, it should be noted in the discussion.

3. The title of the paper may be modified to expose your points clearly.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests