Reviewer's report

Title: Genotypic and phenotypic analysis of male breast cancer shows under representation of the HER2 and basal subtypes in BRCA-associated carcinomas.

Version: 3 Date: 26 July 2012

Reviewer: Larissa Korde

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions:
1) In the Abstract, it is not clear what the HR’s for clinicopathologic features and prognostic variables describe. Please clarify.
2) Conclusion of Abstract states that MBC in BRCA1/2 carriers and BRCAx families is different to females. While this is well discussed in the paper, the abstract itself only describes results of comparison between BRCA1/2 and BRCAx MBC and comparison to results of other studies in sporadic MBC. The results section of the abstract should be revised to include summary of the findings of this study in comparison to female breast ca, or remove this sentence from the conclusion of the abstract.
3) Methods: Provide a bit more detail on the criteria for family enrollment in the kConFab registry.
4) Although this is the only study of it’s kind, I would be very careful about drawing general conclusions from these results, given the small number of cases. In particular, given that there were only 3 male breast cancer cases in BRCA1 carriers, I don’t think it is valid to make any conclusions or generalizations about this group in the discussion section, aside from reporting the incidence.

Minor Essential Revisions:
1) Last sentence of abstract: "Comparison with sporadic MBCs shows several some differences..." - please revise.

Discretionary Revisions:
1) I am not sure that Figures 2-5, and Supplementary Figures 1-2 are all necessary - consider eliminating.
2) Figure 7 - consider including figures for only those variables that were statistically significant

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.