Reviewer’s report

Title: Hypofractionated stereotactic radiotherapy of limited brain metastases: A single-centre individualized treatment approach

Version: 1 Date: 12 September 2012

Reviewer: Oliver Ganslandt

Reviewer’s report:

This is a well written manuscript that describes the outcome of different hypofractionation protocols in the treatment of brain metastases. The authors retrospectively evaluate a cohort of 85 pats. (with 124 brain mets) of whom 72 mets have been treated with radiation before.

The authors tailored the hypofractionation schemes according to volume and neurotoxicity constraints. The main schemes were 6-7 x 5 Gy and 10 x 4 Gy. The authors conclude that the 10 x 4 Gy hfSRT is superior to protocols that apply higher single dose fractions regarding effectiveness and safety.

Major Compulsory Revisions:

With so many different fractionation protocols as used in this study for the reader it is difficult to extract the relation of the patients characteristics to the results and each scheme. I would like the authors to rearrange their table work and allocate patient characteristics (table 1) to each fractionation scheme (similar as in the publication[1] including the RPA classes. It would also improve the clearness if the endpoints (LC, DC, IC, and OS) were allocated to the different protocols.

Minor Essential Revisions

The authors should explain the difference between local control and intracranial control/distant brain control since no further details are given in the results section under the heading “local control and intracranial control”.


Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a
statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

The reviewer declares that he has worked as an scientific adviser for BrainLAB AG, Feldkirchen, Germany and has repeatedly received speaker's honorarium.