Reviewer's report

Title: BMP and TGFbeta Pathways in Human Central Chondrosarcoma: Enhanced Endoglin and Smad 1 Signaling in High Grade Tumors

Version: 2 Date: 15 July 2012

Reviewer: John Healey

Reviewer's report:

The authors have responded to the questions. However, they don’t solve the weaknesses of the paper.

1. Correction for multiple comparisons must be made, or a convincing justification for why it is not necessary. For example, data dredging like reporting for each chondrosarcoma grade and then lumping all grade 2 and 3 tumors together is questionable and generates different statistical results for different parameters. This calls the overall analysis into question.

2. The p 10 revision “Therefore, the hypothesis can be made that endoglin could represent an important mediator of tumorangiogenesis in high-grade chondrosarcoma. The analysis of the correlation between endoglin expression and tumor vascularization would allow to establish whether a link between these pathways could exist in central chondrosarcoma.” This is true. So much so that I think the additional work should be done to make this a paper that tests an hypothesis rather than just generating hypotheses

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interestssss.