Reviewer’s report

Title: Genetic association with overall survival of taxane-treated lung cancer patients - A genome-wide association study in human lymphoblastoid cell lines followed by a clinical association study

Version: 1 Date: 13 May 2012

Reviewer: Daiya Takai

Reviewer’s report:

Major points

The authors attempted to reveal germ-line variations affect chemo-sensitivity to taxane. In this point of view, it was not adequate to combine small cell lung cancer patients and non-small cell lung cancer patients, because taxane was not included in the standard regimen in SCLC treatment in the last decade. Thus, the description, “almost all of the patients were treated with paclitaxel” in the page 15 of the manuscript, sounds quite strange. If SCLC patients are treated with taxane in the institute, it should be describe in the table 1.

Furthermore, the confuse lead wrong a wrong conclusion. At least, to the SCLC patients treated with standard the standard without taxane, how the authors can justify imputation of LCLs’ SNP marker associated with taxane resistance?

And another result of siRNA targeting experiment in H196 small cell lung cancer cell line is also quite strange. Patients treated with taxane are NSCLC in this study. How to interpret SCLC cell line in vitro experiment in this situation?

Probably, the result of this study should be that: the outcome of relative uniform SCLC patients might be stands on germ-line variation; however, outcome of NSCLC might be stands on somatic mutation of cancer cells themselves because biological behavior of NSCLC is widely diverse.

Minor point

Hyperlinks assigned to URLs should be removed.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.