Reviewer’s report

Title: Loss-of-heterozygosity on chromosome 19q in early-stage serous ovarian cancer is associated with recurrent disease

Version: 1 Date: 10 June 2012

Reviewer: Jeff Bell

Reviewer’s report:

The hypothesis and purpose are clearly stated.
The methods are adequately described. The data and results are sound. However, the data on P53 association is given, so the authors can delete the comment about “data not shown”. If they feel that it can be presented in some other way in the results, they can do so, but it obviously is a major part of the discussion.
The discussion is good and not too repetitive of the results. Reference to their own work and others is adequate.
The title is appropriate. The writing is acceptable except for a few minor spelling and grammatical errors.

1- No major compulsory revisions
2- Minor essential revisions: a few spelling and grammatical errors.

Although the authors comment on the small study population as a possible reason for FIGO stage not being an independent prognostic factor, they should put more emphasis on the fact that the study unlikely had the power to find significance in many of the other variables.

3- Discretionary revisions: The discussion about P53 is interesting. This reader was curious about a comparison between P53 and LOH feasibility, reproducibility, and cost. Since both tests are now associated with outcome, and LOH is associated with P53, is the next step to do multivariate analysis using these two tests? Since P53 is discovered in a greater proportion of high grade serous cancers, is LOH 19 the test to predict recurrence more accurately?
The discussion about Gorringe’s study is somewhat confusing. Why was “there no overlap with the regions” on chromosome 19? This raises the question of reproducibility of LOH technology.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the
statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I have no competing interests.