Reviewer’s report

Title: Is there a role of whole-body bone scan in patients with esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 12 March 2012

Reviewer: Hongcheng Shi

Reviewer’s report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions
1. It is well known that histopathology results is the standard diagnosis for bone metastasis. In this paper, authors regard X-ray, CT and MRI imaging findings as final diagnosis of bone metastasis. How to avoid false negative and false positive of X-ray, CT and MRI imaging?
2. Authors introduced that a negative bone scan was considered as false negative if confirmed bone metastasis occurred after esophagectomy in patients with surgery or within 6 months of initial bone scan in patients without surgery. How do you know that the new metastasis lesion was existed at the time of bone scan was performed but it is not new a occurred after bone scan?
3. Any kinds of malignant tumor include esophagus carcinoma may has bone metastasis. Patient suffered from two different malignant tumors at the same time is not uncommon. How could you tell those bone metastasis lesion from esophagus carcinoma but not other malignant tumors according to medical imaging findings?

- Minor Essential Revisions
The sentence in the paper “Of the 72 patients without whole-body bone scan staging, 42 patients received esophagectomy, and bone recurrence occurred in 6 patients at 70 days, 94 days, 226 days, 253 days, 363 days, and 913 days after esophagectomy.” Should be “Of the 72 patients without whole-body bone scan staging, 42 patients received esophagectomy, and bone metastasis occurred in 6 patients at 70 days, 94 days, 226 days, 253 days, 363 days, and 913 days respectively after esophagectomy.”

- Discretionary Revisions
This paper title is “Is there a role of whole-body bone scan in patients with esophageal squamous cell carcinoma”. In discussion part authors talk something about PET/CT. It has nothing to do with bone scan in this paper. What do the authors want to introduce?
In this paper patient underwent bone scan was not so much. And the positive case was very limited. It is difficult to avoid statistics bias.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being
published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests