Reviewer’s report

Title: Ephrin-A1 Inhibits NSCLC Tumor Growth via Induction of Cdx-2 a Tumor Suppressor Gene

Version: 2 Date: 18 April 2012

Reviewer: Christine Sers

Reviewer’s report:


Manuscript MS: 8105501896555942 second review

The manuscript of Bhagyalaxmi A. et al describes EphA2 receptor (EphA2) activation through the ligand EphrinA1 (EFNA1), a subsequent induction of cdx-2, a tumor suppressor gene, which finally leads to decreased cell proliferation and tumor growth via suppression of the tight junction protein Claudin-2.

In the previous review several criticisms were expressed many of them related to the overall scientific quality. In general the authors have invested some efforts to improve their work, including the English of the text and removal of preliminary comments.

However, some important controls such as i) ELISA for EFNA1, ii) controls for the quality of knock-down and iii) overexpression of EphA2 are still lacking. Also the overloading of the Western Blots has not been corrected thus preventing any reasonable semi-quantitative analysis of the results.

In addition, the scientific discussion of their results is narrow not taking into account the broad biological effects of Ephrin signaling and the multiple way claudins can be regulated.

Therefore, I cannot express my satisfaction with the author’s improvements and would again vote for including all controls as already demanded in my first review in order to end up with a manuscript fulfilling the requirements of good scientific practice. In addition, I would suggest that the authors improve their discussion by critically reflecting their own data and considering a wider context of their findings.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests