Reviewer's report

Title: Selective Inhibition of Fatty Acid Synthase by (-)-Epigallocatechin-3-gallate Against Lung Cancer Xenografts

Version: 1 Date: 16 February 2012

Reviewer: Yoichiro Moriya

Reviewer's report:

1) Major Compulsory Revisions
In in vivo tumor therapeutic experiment, authors said that two out of five animals of control group were discarded because of not enough tumor growth. Omitting the animals after starting the experiment is a serious violation. This means that the xenograft model used was not rigidly established. Authors should perform the experiment over again. The number of animals in each group should be same and be more than five. Statistical analysis should be done using appropriate method, preferably, Wilcoxon test on final day.

2) Minor Essential Revisions
Fig.4A: Expressing Y-axis by tumor volume is highly recommended, preferably, logarithmically.

3) Minor Essential Revisions
In Methods: It is unclear when the drug was started to be injected into mice. Immediately after the tumor cell inoculation? or when tumor volume reached around 200mm3?

4) Minor Essential Revisions
In Methods, Growth Inhibition Assay: The calculation method for IC50 is unclear. The equation does not indicate the calculation of IC50 value. In addition, authors said the IC50 of C75 and EGCG was 100microM and 300microM, respectively. However, judging from the additional file figure, it seems that they are IC70 .

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.