Reviewer's report

Title: Atypical Primary Meningioma in the Nasal Septum with Malignant Transformation and Distant Metastasis

Version: 1 Date: 18 March 2012

Reviewer: Oliver Grauer

Reviewer's report:

Shin et al. are presenting an interesting case of an atypical primary extracranial meningioma originating from the nasal septum that recurred with malignant transformation and extracranial metastasis. This case report is well presented including relevant clinical, radiological and histopathological features and illustrated with CT/MRI scans and high-quality photographs that are provided by written consent from the relatives of the patient.

There is one point which needs further clarification. The authors describe that the patient died within one month after diagnosis of two extracranial metastases. In the manuscript they mention that the tumors were slowly growing subcutaneously, however histology revealed malignant transformation with a high mitotic index. It is hard to believe that these two metastases have been responsible for the death of the patient. The authors should provide the reader with some more information why the patient died and whether the death of the patient is related to the diagnosis of a malignant extracranial meningioma. Did they examine the patient for further extracranial metastases before he died, e.g. with a PET-CT? Moreover, did the patient respond to radiotherapy which was given for the local recurrence of the meningioma at the nasal septum? If not, could the authors clarify whether local tumor progression was the cause of death of the patient.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: ‘I declare that I have no competing interests’