Reviewer's report

Title: Cyclin A1 shows age-related expression in benign tonsils, HPV16-dependent overexpression in HNSCC and predicts lower recurrence rate in HNSCC independently of HPV16

Version: 1 Date: 20 March 2012

Reviewer: Martin MC Canis

Reviewer's report:

The authors investigated protein expression of Cyclin A1 in 81 patients with HNSCC and 74 patients after tonsillectomy. Data was correlated with clinical parameters, HPV status, copy numbers of E6/7, and p16.

In conclusion the authors showed an age-dependent rate of expression, and overexpression is correlated to lower recurrence rate in HNSCC independently of HPV16. This is a nicely written manuscript that addresses an important question in the field of HPV research.

Minor points:

Background: this section is hard to read and should be re-written more clearly. L. 12: "and" is doubled

Results: tables may be re-ordered since methods section is after results.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.