Reviewer’s report

Title: Necdin modulates proliferative cell survival of human cells in response to genotoxic stress

Version: 2 Date: 16 April 2012

Reviewer: Loretta Lau

Reviewer’s report:

Except for the following comment for discretionary revision, there are no further comments regarding the revised manuscript or the responses to comments.

In the original manuscript, the authors were not able to demonstrate a relationship between p53 and Necdin via SV40 (Old Fig. 1). This is now replaced by nutlin treatment, which increases p53 levels, and by expressing p53 inhibitor GSE, which inhibits p53 function. These manipulations result in increase and decrease in Necdin, respectively (Fig. 1). I agree there is a “link between necdin and p53”, as described in the first para. of results section, and this is the effect of p53 on Necdin, i.e. p53 positively regulates Necdin expression. This is different to Figure 6, which suggests Necdin regulates p53 response since Necdin was shown to confer radioresistance. In other words, the data or “link” demonstrated in Fig. 1 does not help support the evidence shown in Fig 6 or provide any insight into the mechanism by which Necdin can inhibit p53 response. It seems that Fig. 1 can confuse readers, rather than help with understanding the experimental data.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.