Reviewer's report

Title: Downregulation of SAV1 plays a role in pathogenesis of high-grade clear cell renal cell carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 26 September 2011

Reviewer: sunil sudarshan

Reviewer's report:

This is a nice report on the role for SAV1 downregulation in ccRCC. The downstream effects of SAV1 are largely confirmatory of prior reports, but do provide evidence of functional modulation of HIPPO signaling. Of notable interest are the studies on the localization of YAP1 in ccRCC which are novel and interesting.

Minor
The rational for KPNA6 as a loading control should be described in the methods
Statistical methods are poorly described in the Methods section
It would be ideal to demonstrate SAV1 protein expression in a panel of RCC lines relative to HK2

Major
The data seem to support that reduced SAV1 inhibits apoptosis as opposed to promoting proliferation. The text should more accurately reflect this.
The microarray data on the RCC lines should be deposited (i.e. publicly available) since these data are used to generate figure 1A

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests