Reviewer's report

Title: TNFR2 +676 T>G polymorphism predicts survival of non-Small cell lung cancer patients treated with chemoradiotherapy

Version: 1 Date: 9 June 2011

Reviewer: Petri Mattila

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions
1) Of the 225 patients 79 had adenocarcinoma, 71 squamous cell carcinoma, and 75 other type of NSCLC. The authors have not evaluated if these three groups of patients differed in the frequency of genotypes, or if the observed association between the TNFR2 genotype and survival was restricted to a certain subtype of NSCLC. Although the numbers of patients may be too small to reliably address these issues, it makes sense to make an effort to do an analysis on this, as the biologic characteristics of adenocarcinoma and squamous cell carcinoma are likely different, ie. adenocarcinoma may be more resistant to radiotherapy

2) Were the adenocarcinomas primary lung adenocarcinomas? Were there any adenocarcinoma metastasis in the lungs with a primary tumor outside the lungs?

3) What were the 75 other types of NSCLC?

4) Not all patients received chemotherapy (163 out of 225 got platinum and taxane). The title gives the impression that the observed association was restricted to patients who received chemoradiotherapy. Was there an association between TNFR2 polymorphisms and survival in patients who received only radiotherapy?

Minor Essential Revisions
1) The authors should describe the dosing of platium and taxane based chemotherapy used at their center and if chemotherapy was given concurrently with radiotherapy

2) Affiliation of Ritsuko Komaki (2) is not reported.

3) The official gene symbols according to pubmed for TNF and TNFR2 (CD120b) are TNF and TNFRSF1B as spelled in italics. These designations should be used consistently in the manuscript.

Discretionary Revisions
1) It would be preferable to use rs numbering of the SNPs in the abstract.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.