Reviewer's report

Title: Oncolytic Targeting of Androgen-sensitive Prostate Tumor by the Respiratory Syncytial Virus (RSV): Consequences of Deficient Interferon-dependent Anti-viral Defense

Version: 1 Date: 6 June 2010

Reviewer: Hideaki Miyake

Reviewer's report:

The topic of this study is timely and interesting; however, there seems to be several points to be improved in this manuscript.

(Major Compulsory Revisions)

1. The significance of this study is almost similar to that of previously published manuscript by authors same as this study. Although the authors emphasized that they used androgen-dependent LNCaP cells in this study, they had not assessed the effect of RSV on LNCaP cells considering their androgen-dependent characteristics. It would be strongly recommended to investigate the impact of RSV without androgen on the growth of LNCaP cells both in vitro and in vivo.

2. The authors examined the effect of RSV through the intratumoral injection. However, if RSV would be applied to clinical practice, it might be much more variable to administer it systemically targeting metastatic diseases. Accordingly, the authors should give comments on this issue.

(Minor Essential Revisions)

1. The last sentence in Results of Abstract section should be omitted or moved to the Conclusions.

2. The last paragraph of Background section overlaps Results section.

3. The description regarding the characters of RM1 cells in the first paragraph of Results section should be moved to Methods section.

4. The last two paragraphs of Results section should be omitted or moved to Discussion section.

5. The last sentence of the third paragraph of Discussion section seems to be evidently overdiscussed.

6. There is no description concerning the guideline of animal experiments followed by the authors.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.