Reviewer's report

Title: Oncolytic Targeting of Androgen-sensitive Prostate Tumor by the Respiratory Syncytial Virus (RSV): Consequences of Deficient Interferon-dependent Anti-viral Defense

Version: 1 Date: 31 May 2010

Reviewer: William Jia

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

My major concern is that the authors did not show viral replication in tumor mass after intratumoral injection in animal models. If the virus is replicating in the tumor, why repeated injections were needed? This is an important point since it distinguishes whether the tumor regression is caused by true viral lytic infection and dissemination or by viral induced apoptosis but also self-elimination in the tumor. If the authors are not able to answer this question at this time, at least they need to discuss this point in the Discussion.

Discretionary Revisions

1) The tumor growth was only observed up to 14 days after the last viral injection. Have authors observed longer time period after viral treatment stopped?

2) Initial tumor size when the virus was injected should be indicated.

3) In RM1 syngeneic model, do we know if antibody against RSV is generated? How long it takes the animal to generate the antibody and would that affect the efficacy of the repeated viral injection?

4) Figure 4 should indicate the time point when the animals were killed. Also, Why the TUNEL staining shown in Figure 4a seems not a usual nuclear staining pattern.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests