Reviewer's report

Title: Intracranial metastasis from primary transitional cell carcinoma of female urethra: case report & review of the literature

Version: 1 Date: 21 October 2010

Reviewer: Marco Petrillo

Reviewer's report:

The paper by Kyung-Sub Moon. et al. reported a case of intracranial metastases from primary transitional cell carcinoma (TCC) of female urethra. To date no cases of brain metastases arising from this uncommon tumor type has been reported; so that the novelty of the presented manuscript seems to be acceptable, but, on the other hand some major criticisms have to be raised:

- Considering the primary end-point of the manuscript a detailed description of patient medical history is required. In particular, it seems mandatory to specify in text if surgery was able to remove all intracranial metastases. Moreover, was CT scan performed at the time of initial diagnosis as a part of staging work up? Please detail.

- It could be very useful to include in the manuscript some details about the chemotherapy and neurosurgery related toxicities.

- Considering the very dismal survival in patients with proven diagnosis of brain metastases from TCC, with only 2 months of post-brain diagnosis survival reported by the authors, the surgical choice seems to be questionable. For these reasons, we suggest to the authors to provide a wider discussion on this crucial point in the appropriate manuscript section.

- In order to improve the quality of the manuscript it could be very useful to include in the manuscript a brief review of the previously reported cases of intracranial metastases arising from urinary TCC, focusing on the clinical management of this rare and very unfavourable entity.

- The references section seems to be redundant, please include only appropriate citations.

Minor revisions:
1) Page 6, line 1: please correct “squmaous” with “squamous”.
2) Page 6, line 10: replace “adaption” with “adoption”.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'