Reviewer’s report

Title: Adenoviral infectivity of Exfoliated Viable Cells in Urine: Implications for the Detection of Bladder Cancer

Version: 1 Date: 30 March 2011

Reviewer: Daniel Maneval

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revision:

Incubation of cells with Ad-GFP constructs was based on calculation of MOI. If conditions were very similar among experiments (e.g., # cells/plate, volume of incubation, etc.) MOI can be an appropriate measure of virus concentration. However, if cell concentration differed significantly among outgrowths and MOI was computed, the results may be influenced by differences in adenovirus concentrations. Please list actual adenovirus concentrations (particles/mL or pfu/mL) used for incubation in the different cell outgrowth specimens reported in Figures 3-4. See Nyberg-Hoffman C, Shabram P, Li W, Giroux D, Aguilar-Cordova E. Nat Med. 1997 Jul;3(7):808-11 for consideration.

Discretionary Revision:

1) The 2010 Cancer Facts and Figures from the American Cancer Society lists bladder cancer as the 5th highest in estimated new cases of cancers by site.

2) Were cells outgrowths independently evaluated for survivin expression using analysis of protein or RNA? Did survivin expression correlation with GFP transgene expression?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I am a former employee of Canji Inc and Schering-Plough corporation and have worked on adenovirus-based gene delivery projects for treatment of bladder cancer.