Reviewer's report

Title: Adenoviral infectivity of Exfoliated Viable Cells in Urine: Implications for the Detection of Bladder Cancer

Version: 1 Date: 29 March 2011

Reviewer: Liana Adam

Reviewer's report:

The manuscript by Murali et al., is describing a feasibility study for a potential new method of diagnosis in bladder cancer. The experiments are well described and designed for this initial stage. The only drawback is that it does seem a little too complex as it necessitated 10 days of cellular manipulations including transfections to get a positive result on the presence or absence of viable cells (characterized by active expression of survivin). It is not clear what would be the advantage of this cumbersome manipulation over measuring the survivin expression, which apparently has proven to have high sensitivity and specificity in bladder cancer. A comparison of this method side-by-side with the other diagnostic tools using exfoliated cells from urine would be an interesting follow-up of this initial study.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests with any of the methods or concepts described in this manuscript.