Reviewer’s report

Title: The natural triterpene maslinic acid induces apoptosis in HT29 colon cancer cells by a JNK-p53-dependent mechanism.

Version: 2 Date: 16 November 2010

Reviewer: Manuel Perucho

Reviewer’s report:

I agree with referee #1 that the authors have not addressed in a direct manner the objections raised by the referee. However, I also think that overall, the revised manuscript is an improved version over the original, and that the criticisms by referee #1, while correct, they are not essential for the main message of the paper. Also, the comment that this paper is just a continuation of the previously published study by the authors, is somewhat incorrect because the new paper contains significant new additional data.

My main concern with the paper is the use of a single tumor cell line in which are based all the conclusions. It is not sound to generalize on potential inhibitory effects of a particular drug on human colon cancer based only on the data derived from in vitro studies with a single tumor cell line.

The authors should address this issue and mention the need to extend the studies to additional cell lines to see the degree of generalization of the findings.