Reviewer's report

Title: Increasing renal cell cancer among black Americans: an epidemiologic review

Version: 3 Date: 23 February 2011

Reviewer: Paul A Godley

Reviewer's report:

These remain Major Compulsory Revisions

Of the three criticisms that I noted in my previous critique, only one has been adequately addressed. I had mentioned that the rationale for the manuscript was weak, since there was little comparative epidemiologic data stratified by race to discuss. I think this remains a problem. The second issue, where I complained about the use of the word, "paradoxical," was addressed by the authors. Finally, I had asked for more discussion of racial differences in abdominal imaging. The revised wording remains unclear on how variations in abdominal imaging by race and over time, may have affected the incidence of renal cell carcinoma among blacks. I think this is worth discussing clearly even if definitive data is not available.

In addition, I would note that while the authors revised their manuscript title, it still does not describe the problem that the manuscript discusses. It's not increasing RCC incidence among blacks that is the issue, since incidence is also increasing among whites, it's the persistent racial disparity in RCC incidence that the authors are addressing with their review of etiologic studies. The title should be changed to more accurately reflect the content of the manuscript.

Level of interest: An article of insufficient interest to warrant publication in a scientific/medical journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests