Reviewer's report

Title: Rapidly increasing renal cell cancer among black Americans: an epidemiologic review

Version: 1 Date: 23 November 2010

Reviewer: Nabih Asal

Reviewer's report:

The submitted manuscript is worthy of publication provided some modifications and changes are made. As can be noted from the attached slides on Kidney Cancer (85% is RCC) in Florida, the Incidence data from the Florida Cancer Data System is somewhat different than the SEER National data. In Florida, the incidence rates, although on the rise, they are lower in Blacks than Whites and early stage is only slightly higher in Blacks with more Black cases are unstaged than White cases.

For 2004, incidence rate in Blacks is slightly lower (males and females) while mortality rate is slightly higher (males only).

The claim in the methods section that ,”virtually no epidemiologic studies examining risk factors for renal cell cancer separately among Blacks,” is not accurate. However, the authors do note that small numbers of Black participants prevented presentation of data for Blacks separately. I do recommend that the authors review the three publications on a study completed in Florida that included Blacks and Whites and the data for Blacks is presented separately. Clearly the numbers for Blacks (73 cases and 71 controls) is somewhat small.

The Results sections on Genetic Susceptibility and Chronic Renal Disease are excellent. The section on obesity, Cigarette Smoking, and Diet could be improved by incorporating findings from the 3 attached references especially the association between environmental tobacco smoke and RCC in Blacks, more refined measures of obesity as reported separately for Blacks and Whites, and the protective effect between RCC and vegetables, broccoli, vitamins A, C, D, K, calcium, iron, potassium and zinc that are present in whites but not in Blacks. Also the increase risk associated with intake of Fried meats, hot dogs, and lunch meat that is present in Blacks as well as Dairy products.

The Conclusion section should also be modified to reflect recent findings on the association between Obesity, body composition, and environmental tobacco smoke in Blacks.
