Reviewer's report

Title: Adjuvant therapy for locally advanced renal cell cancer: A systematic review with meta-analysis

Version: 1 Date: 28 November 2010

Reviewer: Yuki Moritoki

Reviewer's report:

The authors Scherr et. al. examined a role of adjuvant therapy for locally advanced renal cell cancer after surgical resection by systematic review. Although meta-analysis for their selected papers was worth to do, the manuscript was not well prepared as follows:

Major concerns:

#1. Figure legends did not correspond to the actual figures. It was assumed that if the authors combined legends of Figure 2 and 3, it would correspond to Figure 1. Similarly a combined legend of Figure 4 and 5 would be suitable for Figure 2. Figure 1 legend should be corresponding to the Figure 3.

#2. The word “Table” was severally described in this manuscript, however, no tables were included in this manuscript.

#3. In Figure 1 for overall survival, values of hazard ratio and 95% CI for vaccine therapy and immunotherapy had discrepancy with those described in text.

Minor concerns:


Taken together, this manuscript was insufficiently prepared for submission. Careful preparation for a precisely described manuscript is essential to show scientific credible results.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.