Reviewer's report

Title: Seminal vesicle metastasis after partial hepatectomy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Version: 1 Date: 30 April 2010

Reviewer: Hans Spangenberg

Reviewer's report:

The authors have addressed the questions raised by the reviewers however the detailed history of the patient is still not adequately presented.

Therapies, AFP levels and imaging should be enlisted chronologically, in order to convince the reader that the metastasis was primarily in the seminal vesicle and that the seminal vesicle was not just invaded by peritoneal metastasis of the HCC. Furthermore the therapy applied, left hepatectomy, multiple RFA followed by resection and so on has to be explained, since it is unclear why primary resection of the right lobe was not done.

The others state that chemotherapy was performed, what agent was given and at what time. Thymic peptide injection is not a chemotherapy.

Furthermore, the sentence that symptomatic therapy was not performed because of the weakness of the patient? Certainly, symptomatic therapy can be applied in this situation, I guess they mean that specific antitumoral therapy could not be given.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.