Author's response to reviews

Title: Favourable Ten-Year Overall Survival in a Caucasian Population with High Probability of Hereditary Breast Cancer

Authors:

Laura Cortesi (hbc@unimo.it)
Cristina Masini (cristinamas@libero.it)
Claudia Cirilli (cirilli.claudia@policlinico.mo.it)
Veronica Medici (veronica.medici@gmail.com)
Isabella Marchi (robertoisa@alice.it)
Giovanna Cavazzini (giovanna.cavazzini@ospedalimantova.it)
Giuseppe Pasini (Giuseppe.Pasini@auslrm.net)
Daniela Turchetti (danielat@med.unibo.it)
Massimo Federico (mfederico@unimore.it)

Version: 4 Date: 19 January 2010

Author's response to reviews:

Dear Editor,

enclose please find the revised manuscript entitled “Favourable Ten-Year Overall Survival in a Caucasian Population with High Probability of Hereditary Breast Cancer” by Laura Cortesi, Cristina Masini, Claudia Cirilli, Veronica Medici, Isabella Marchi, Giovanna Cavazzini, Giuseppe Pasini, Daniela Turchetti, Massimo Federico to be considered for publication on “BMC Cancer”.

We resubmitted this manuscript modified accordingly to the reviewers concerns and criticisms. We hope that revision will render the manuscript acceptable for publication in your journal.

Here the responses to the reviewers questions:

Reviewer Paul Van Diest:

BRCA1 and sporadic BCs have been randomized matched for age at diagnosis, (range between 26 and 76 +/- 4 years), grading (I, II, and III) and stage (I, II, and III) with a ratio 1:4. No matching was performed for type of tumor since many BRCA1 cases should have been erased, while tumor size falls within the stage.

This final analysis results in a statistically significant advantage for BRCA1 carriers in terms of ten-years OS and make our findings of relevant practical value because all confounders have been removed.

Reviewer Andrea Veronesi:

The paper has been resubmitted to an editorial review for the English language corrections. All the paper, included the points raised by the reviewer, has been revised.

Associate editor comments:
our results have been over-emphasized in terms of practical value both in the Abstract Conclusions, where the phrase "Since only 30% of patients with a high probability of being hereditary results in a BRCA1 mutation, selecting women with a long term OS among this population could increase the analysis positive rate, avoiding useless expensive test" has been added, and in the Discussion session where the clinical importance of being BRCA1 carrier in terms of prognosis and treatment has been underlined.

Sincerely
Dr. Laura Cortesi
Dipartimento di Oncologia ed Ematologia
Università degli Studi di Modena e Reggio Emilia
Via del Pozzo 71
41100 Modena