Reviewer's report

Title: Expression of ZIC family genes in meningiomas and other brain tumors

Version: 2 Date: 21 January 2010

Reviewer: Irene Szijan

Reviewer's report:

Dear Editor,

I did not find the cover letter describing the changes in the revised manuscript thus, I had difficulties in the revision of the changes made in the amended text. Nevertheless, I found some of the suggested modifications and my answers are as follows:

Major Compulsory Revisions:

- The Figure 1B was changed and now the data agree with those in the text.
- The legend to Figure 6 was modified and is more clear than the previous.
- The first paragraph of Discussion was changed but there is a typo mistake in line 5: …”are higher in ? than in normal tissue.
- The statement (Discussion) about the presence of ZIC4 in paraneoplastic syndrome, small-cell lung carcinoma…..was discussed extensively as suggested, but it is not clear if ZIC4 (previous manuscript) or ZIC2 (revised manuscript) is associated with small-cell lung carcinoma.
- The criticism about the small number of samples used for ZIC mRNA analysis (3 meningioma specimens) was not answered.
- The request about “Semiquantitative RT-PCR” and some data in figures 1 and 6 were not answered.
- The Point 1 in Conclussions was amended.

Most of the Minor Essential Revisions were answered except that about “ZIC transcript in meningiomas are higher than …..in normal dura mater”, the data in dura mater are not shown.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'