Author's response to reviews

Title: Tumor location and patient characteristics of colon and rectal adenocarcinomas associating survival with TNM classes

Authors:

  Kari Hemminki (k.hemminki@dkfz.de)
  Irene Santi (i.santi@dkfz.de)
  Marianne Weires (m.weires@dkfz.de)
  Hauke Thomsen (h.thomsen@dkfz.de)
  Jan Sundquist (jan.sundquist@med.lu.se)
  Justo Lorenzo Bermejo (J.Lorenzo@Dkfz-Heidelberg.de)

Version: 3 Date: 24 November 2010

Author's response to reviews: see over
Dear Professor Clarke,

Thanks you for the positive comments. We have responded to the Reviewer comments as detailed below and indicated the changes in the manuscript by underlining.

Sincerely yours,

Kari Hemminki on behalf of the co-authors

Reviewer's report:
Minor Essential revisions
1. The title does not convey the aims of the study and remains slightly confusing.

>>> Title was revised.

2. On page 4, under "subjects and Methods" the authors used the term "are believed to approach 100%". It would be better if the authors gave a no. % as this does not tell us how accurate the data collection is. similarly, the term "somewhat" used on Pg 8 is non-specific.

>>> A qualifying statement was added, p. 4. ‘Somewhat’ was deleted.

3. The cohorts still remain very confusing. Data is retrieved from the registry from 1958 - 2008 but survival analysis done on cohort from 2000 - 2008 and another cohort for TMN analysis is from 2002 - 2008 but later ammended to 2004 - 2008 due to poor collection in the 1st 2 years.
In addition, the nos. in the cohort do not seem to tally - on pg8, there is 10174 subjects with TNM data but on page 7, there is 6105.
It might be less confusing to state fewer dates and use cohorts starting from the same time.

>>> These are unfortunately the periods data are available. We deleted some unnecessary references to the dates/numbers, as the reviewer suggested.

Minor discretionary revisions
The paper is still fairly difficult to read due to the language.
Level of interest: An article of limited interest
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being Published

>>> Paper was once more proof-read for English.