Reviewer's report

Title: Weight change during chemotherapy is a poor prognostic in non metastatic breast cancer

Version: 2 Date: 7 July 2010

Reviewer: Patricia Thompson

Reviewer's report:

Overall the authors have been highly responsive to the majority of reviewer critiques. However, the authors fail to provide a convincing rationale for combining analysis of weight loss and weight gain as a single weight change variable that would be of clinical relevance or individually informative for poor outcomes in non metastatic breast cancer. The authors themselves present different mechanisms by which gain and loss act as adverse factors. This reviewer appreciates that the sample size is likely too small to detect significant effects of weight gain or loss as independent factors. Perhaps, showing the results of each alone, even if not significant would strengthen the presentation. The authors should discuss the limitations of collapsing the two if in fact the mechanism of effect on outcome is likely to be different. Going forward, it is unclear what hypothesis is being tested with weight variation given the different mechanisms. This continues to diminish overall enthusiasm for the study.

There are a number of typos, misspellings and corrections to the newly added text that need attention. These are considered minor.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests