Reviewer’s report

Title: Prediction and diagnosis of bladder cancer recurrence based on urinary content of hTERT, SENP1, PPP1CA, and MCM5 transcripts

Version: 1 Date: 8 July 2010

Reviewer: Kiyohide Fujimoto

Reviewer’s report:

Major comments
Overall, the authors took the prospectively collected urine samples as an object of the present study, and consequently there was no further new information comparing the similar previous reports. There are some problems in understanding the results from this study. The authors did not present their inclusion and exclusion criteria; e.g., concomitant upper urinary tract cancer or prior therapy. The present study analyzed fresh cases and recurrent cases. These backgrounds of patients should be manifested and the data should be analyzed in each subgroup classified according to the patient backgrounds.

Minor comments
The cost for measurement of biomarkers is one of the important financial problems in considering whether these genetic markers are commercially available and useful in routine clinical practice. Did the authors estimate economical benefit of using these biomarkers alternatively to cystoscopy; how is medical cost reduction estimated in comparison with the cost by regularly-repeated follow-up cystoscopies?

Did the authors assess the influence by contamination of normal urothelial cells in the assay? The quality of the analytical results is very likely affected by the contents of urine sample. Although the authors collected 50ml of urine at regular follow-up visits, 50mL seemed to be little to collect viable cells enough to extract mRNAs. Did the samples provide sufficient amount of mRNAs? What device did the investigators make to obtain the sufficient number of exfoliated cells in the urine?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'